[Shri Anil Shastri]

(i) G.S.R. No. 596(E), dated the 22nd June, 1990, setting out the conditions for grant of rebate of duty paid on any excisable goods on their exportation from India to Nepal.

(ii) G.S.R. No. 655(E), dated the 23rd July, 1990 so as to provide excise duty on tea falling under sub-heading 0902-19 of the Central Excise Tariff Act, 1985 shall not be required to be paid during the period from 28.2.1986 to 1.1.1989 if such tea is made from duty paid tea falling under the same sub-heading by the process of blending, sorting or packing. [Placed in Library *See* No. LT—]

ALLEGED ATROCITIES ON WOMEN IN WEST BENGAL

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER): Madam Deputy Chairman. I rise in protest against the way Doordarshan twists and twists the news against our party and our leader. Yesterday, Doordarshan in its news said only these two lines " The Congress (I) president, Mr. Rajiv Gandhi alleged that it was a hurried decision to obtain political mileage." That is what was said. On the contrary, the Congress (I) president welcomed the announcement of the Prime Minister and went on to show as to what flaws it suffers from. But unfortunately Doordarshan every time twists and twists the news as though this one sentence gives an impression that the Congress (I) president is against it. I would like to condemn this attitude of Doordarshan.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): Madam Deputy Chairman, I want to draw your kind attention to a very important issues.

संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री तथा पर्यटन मंत्रालय में राज्यमंत्री (श्री सत्यपाल मलिक): ये प्रसार-भारती का भी विरोध कर रहे हैं।...**(व्यवधान)**

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu): Madam, I would like to raise an important issue .....*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH; The Governor has given a report to the president of India about a certain situation obtaining in Tripura. Some Members of Parliament have also submitted a report to the President yesterday. We want the Governor's report to be laid on the the Table ; and also Mr. Yashwant Singh led delegation's report...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Multi-channels do not come into my ears because four, four people speak together.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: You allowed me to speak.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Actually I had allowed Jayanthi Natarajan to raise something. Let her finish. I will allow you later.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: A very important issue I want to bring to the notice of the house. A Mahila Congress activist was shot dead by the police in Calcutta.....*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: What happened in Tripura? Hundreds of tribal women were raped.....*(Interruptions)*... There is a difference between the two situations. There are certain anti-social elements who are indulging in ... *(Interruptions)*...in West Bengal. But in Tripura there is State violence.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Congress MLAs and workers have been assaulted by the police in West Bengal.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, there are certain anti-social elements .....*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, 16 MLAs have been beaten up by the police.....*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Hear her what she is saying. Try to understand what she is saying (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: She is saying that the Mahila Congress worker has been killed by the police *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Dipen Ghosh, she is telling me. She is telling the Chair and not to you. So let her say.

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय (उत्तर प्रदेश): प्रधानमंत्री जी महिलाओं पर अत्याचार हो रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, Congress(I) workers are indulging in holiganism. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal): Madam, In Calcutta, Congress(I) workers .....(*Interruptions*)

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया (बिहार): महोदया, अगर इसी तरह से यह नहीं बोलने देंगे तो यह भी जब अपनी आवाज बुलंद करेंगे तो हम भी इन्हें नहीं बोलने देंगे। यह व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है।...(व्यवधान)... अन्याय हो रहा है। पश्चिम बंगाल की सरकार महिलाओं पर अत्याचार कर रही है, गोलियां चला रही हैं और लोगों को जेल में डाला जा रहा है ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर (उत्तर प्रदेश): कांग्रेस की सरकार में बी०जे०पी० वर्कर्स को ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam. Congress workers are indulging in hooliganism.

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर: बंगाल के अंदर...(व्यवधान)... गुंडागर्दी मचा रखी है, बी०जे०पी० के वर्कर्स को मारा जा रहा है। ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, Congress (I) and BJP have united against the left Front in West Bengal. This is the situation (*Interruptions*)

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया: महोदया, ज्योति बसु कहता है जब तक मैं मुख्य मंत्री रहूंगा तब पश्चिम बंगाल में कामरेड का राज चलेगा और अत्याचार चलेगा ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam to bring down the State Government of West Bengal.....(*Interruptions*)... Is this secularism? Shame. ....(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI JAGESH DESAI (Maharashtra): You are preaching sermons. (*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN:....Congress M.L.As have been arrested and beaten up. *(Interruptions)* Jyoti Basu has said. *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Let the Prime Minister reply. Take your seats.

SHRI M. M. JACOB (Kerala): You have permitted her. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : She was allowed. (*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam 16 Congress M.L.As have been beaten up by the police. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. I am trying to hear their voice.(*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: In Tripura, 200 tribal women have been raped (*Interruptions*). Mr. Yashwant Sinha has made....(*Interruptions*). He has submitted a report to the Prime Minister. Let that report be laid on the Table of the House. Let us discuss the matter. (*Interruptions*) We want to discuss. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Madam, you have allowed Mrs. Jayanthi Natarajan to speak and Mr. Dipen Ghosh must be chivalrous to allow her to speak. (*Interruptions*) Why are you unnecessarily getting up? (*Interruptions*) You allow her to speak. She has not even uttered a sentence and you have started. You hear. What is it that she has said? She has not said a word....(*Interruptions*)

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE (Maharashtra): If what you say is not acceptable to us, should we do the same thing to you, Dipen? It may not be acceptable to you. You must first listen. You must learn to

[Shri N.K.P. Salve]

listen, Dipen: It may be unpalatable to you as much as what you talk is unpalatable to us. You must listen even if it is unpalatable to you please (*Interruptions*) I am not for a moment, worried about your opinion. I am not here to be worried about your opinion. I cannot be worried about your opinion here. What you like or don't like does not concern me. What is palatable or unpalatable is your business. She has been given permission by the Chair. Is there anything unparliamentary? (*interruptions*)

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Who has given permission? *(interruptions)*

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: She has a right to speak. She must be allowed to speak. Whether it is acceptable to you or unacceptable to you is irrelevent. She has been called by the Chair to speak and she must speak (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please. Mr. Dipen Ghosh *(Interruptions)*

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: When you have an opportunity, you refute, not otherwise. When you have an opportunity, you refute (*interruptions*) Your have an opportunity to refute. You cannot stop her from speaking under any circumstances. You have no business whatsoever to stop her from speaking under any circumstances whatsoever *(Interruptions)*. It is unpalatable.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (Bihar): Mr. Salve, please control your Members. You control Mr. Ahluwalia.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Mr. Sinha, you are irrelevant. You sit down *...(Interruptions)...* You are wholly irrelevant. Please sit down. Dipen, you must allow her to speak.....(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Let there be a discussion....(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: I do not know what has happened. We must be allowed to speak....(*Interruptions*)...The issue is that we must be allowed to speak.....(*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, please take your seats. I request everybody to take your seat....(*Interruptions*)...Dipen, I also request you to take your seat. Jayanthi, please speak.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, if she is allowed to speak, then I will also be allowed to speak.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: O.K. I will allow you to speak ....(*Interruptions*)...Just a minute. please sit down. Please, let us behave in a same manner. If some Member is agitated and if you are also agitated on some issue, this is the forum where you can make you point and if all of you speak together I don't follow, nobody can write in the gallery and in the press. No body can understand anything. If Jayanthi. If Jayanthi is speaking something which has hurt her and if there is something which has hurt you, I will also allow you to speak....(*Interruptions*)...Have I stopped you to speak?....(*Interruptions*)...Just a minute. I will stop, I will definitely stop you if all of you speak together. if everybody is going to speak together, I will definitely put my foot down. But I will not allow ten people to speak something which we do not follow.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: माथुर साहब आज आप पहली बार इतने एजीटेटेड दीख रहे हैं तो कैसे मैं आपके दिल की ख्वाहिश पूरी नहीं करूंगी । आप बैठ जाइये। I will definitely allow you. आप इतना शोर नहीं कर सकते, आप आराम से बैठ जाइये।

I cannot allow everybody to speak because there might be many matters. I could feel that Mr. Dipen Ghosh and Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta were very agitated. Let Jayanthi Natarajan have her say. Have some patience. You talk of atrocities on women. She is a woman and I am a woman. Please have patience.

SHRI MOTURU HANUMANTHA RAO (Andhra Pradesh): A Commission was appointed for them and its report has already been submitted.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I would request you to have patience. This is not the way we can function.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu): Madam, we are all deeply exercised and extremely agitated over the reign of terror which has been unleshed on the Congress workers in the State of West Bengal. It all started with the incidents of Bantala and Birat where such terrible atrocities were committed against women. There is no safety of women there. There life, their honour, their modesty is simply not safe in the State of West Bengal any more. What happened after that was the Mahila Congress workers and the Congress workers, the Congress activists, in the State of West Bengal took out processions to express their agitation against the terrible incidents against women, their agitation against the price rise and other things, and the Government has unleshed a reign of terror on these people. Even yesterday 16 MLAs were beaten up brutally by the police inspector when they were arrested and taken into custody. And the Chief Minister of West bengal said and in full view of the press that as long as he was there, the cadres of the CPM and the police would not allow the Congress workers to make demonstrations. It is a shame. We all know that even the allies of the Left Front Government in West Bengal have passed resolutions saying that there was a large-scale rigging....

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): How many buses have you burnt?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let her have her say. If you have figures, you can give them later on when you get your chance.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: The CPI, the RSP, the Forward Block, have all passed resolutions alleging that violence and booth capturing took place during the last CMC elections. And this is not something which we are conjuring up out of a hat. There is absolutely no safety for life. When journalists were covering the Congress processions and agitations, they were beaten up by the CPM cadres and the Chief Minister gave a statement in no uncertain terms that as long as he was the Chief Minister, these would continue and the CPM cadres would take to the streets and the police would be used against the Congress workers. Therefore, the lives of the people are not safe there. Never before did incidents against women take place on a large scale as have been taking place in Calcutta. We know what happend in Birat. Women were paraded naked. It is something too horrible to narrate...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I would request you to please have patience. I will allow Mr. Dipen Ghosh to speak. Please sit down. Now Mrs. Natarajan, please be brief.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: I will take just one minute. I am only surprised at the attitude of the State Government. The reason why we feel that our workers and those who are politically opposed to them are not safe in the State any more, is that even the left leaders in the case of incidents like this.... it is such a misfortune... say that those women from Birat were all bad characters, that they were prostitutes, quite regardless of the fact that there was a reign of terror.....

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: What is she saying? She is weaving a sensational story.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, finally.....*(Interruptions)*.... I only want ot say....*(Interruptions)*....Finally, Madam, I only want to say.....*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please let her finish.....*(Interruptions)*...Let her finish.....*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Finally Madam, I just want to say that when you look at the Chief Minister's Statement, it is very clear that this is not just a question of anti-social elements burning buses because it is very strange that the only anti-social elements who get killed and beaten up are the Congress(I) workers. Therefore, we cannot take what the Chief Minister says seriously. Madam, the Prime Minister is sitting over here.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please be brief.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: The Prime Minister is sitting over there, Madam, and I would like to request the Prime Minister to take serious note of this notwithstanding the fact that the CPI (M) is an important constituent of this National Front Government, one of its crutches, and request the Prime Minister to intervene immediately and come forward with a statement on the status of women and women workers and the Congress (I) cadres in the State of West Bengal and bring all the facts before this house so that our workers can be safe in the State of West Bengal.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Mr. Dipen Ghosh.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam Deputy Chairman, there is a limit to this cock-and-bull story narrated in the Rajya Sabha.....(*Interruptions*)...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: This is not a cock-and-bull story. These are all facts.....(*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let him make his speech.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Anyway, Madam, when you had permitted Mrs. Jayanthi Natarajan to speak, I heard her in perfect silence. Madam, by profession she is an advocate and sometimes an advocate is required to take up a brief when there is no brief and to take up an indefensible case to defend. Now, she has taken up an indefensible case to defend.....(*Interruptions*)... The day before yesterday, I was hearing Mr. S.B. Chavan, mentioning about the cascading effect of the rise in the prices of petrol and diesel. and yesterday I heard Prof. Madhu Dandavate admitting what a cascading effect the rise in the prices of petrol and diesel had on the other prices, not only on the cost of transport, but also on other prices, other commodity prices, as a result of the rise in the prices of petrol and diesel. The State Transport Corporation and the Tramways Corporation run by the Government had no option but to raise the bus fare and the tram fares and that too on the basis of the recommendations of an independent Committee headed by a Judge of the High Court. Whatever that Committee had recommended, that recommendation was discussed with all the other political parties including the Congress (I), and on their advice and as recommended by that Committee, it was reduced. It was not effected as recommended by the Committee. But it was reduced on the basis of consultations with all other political parties. But the Congress (I), the BJP, the Naxalites, the SUCI and certain other sundry parties started an agitation against the rise in the tram fare or bus fare. Madam, they have the right to do so. Obviously, in a democratic country, any political party, whether it is the BJP or the Congress(I), has the right to unite against the left parties, against the Left Front Government, to protest against the bus fare hike or tram fare rise. I do not mind it. But the question is that in the name of starting an agitation, Madam, they are burning buses. They are burning buses. State buses, they are burning the trams. Even if you read the editorials of "The Statesman", "The Indian Express" and of newspapers including the "Anand Bazar Patrika" or "Jugantar", you will know.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI (Maharshtra): Ladies burning buses? ....*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat.....*(Interruptions)*...Let him speak. He has a right to speak in this house.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Whether he speaks on women burning or bus burning, that is not your problem. It is his problem. Let him speak. *(Interruptions)* Please sit down. Do not interrupt.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: As many as 90 State buses have been burnt by these agitators. Who has incurred the loss? The nation. *(Interruptions)*

Madam, they are occupying the 'thanas', the police stations, forcibly. They are burning buses and trams. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA (Bihar): This is a cock and bull story. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: In that reckless manner, in the name of democratic rights, in the name of enjoying democratic rights, they have started burning buses and trams and they have started occupying the 'thanas', they are stopping the railways, they are obstructing the roadways and in all walks of life they are creating trouble. Obviously,...*(Time bell rings)* The police, in their exercise to maintain law and order, took recourse to firing. Certain unfortunate things might have taken place. Certain unfortunate results might have come out of the police firing to quell the unruly agitators who were burning buses and trams and occupying 'thanas'. This is one aspect, Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Be brief, please. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Mr. Yadav has pointed out about the burning of women. Yes, in Birati and Bantola certain incidents have taken place. It was a misfortune, for all of us. It was a misfortune for all of us that in Bantola two women officials were manhandled and assaulted ...*(Interruptions)* But in these two cases there were acts of anti-social elements. These are the acts by anti-social elements. The State Government which has instituted a judicial inquiry, has taken the people into custody for committing such offence against the women. But here is a document which shows that 132 tribal women were raped in Tripura and the Governor of Tripura has submitted a report to the President. There was State violence. In Bengal certain anti-social elements are indulging in such activities and the Government is taking action against them. And here in Tripura, State violence is being resorted to. The State Government has committed this violence against the tribal women. And the Governor of Tripura has since submitted a report to the President.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Be brief.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: And he has submitted a report to the Prime Minister yesterday. Let these two reports be laid on the Table of the House for discussion, and then the nation will know who are the enemies of the nation, who are the enemies of women *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat. Mr. Mathur.

श्री जगदीश माथुर (उत्तर प्रदेश): महोदया, मैं एक बड़ी विशेष स्थिति में खड़ा हूं। इधर से शिकवे हैं, उधर से जुल्म हैं ...(**व्यवधान**) अब मैं यह नहीं कह सकता कि मेरी स्थिति क्या है। ...(**व्यवधान**) इन्होंने आरोप लगाया कि कांग्रेस के गुंडे हैं, उन्होंने आरोप लगाया कि सी० पी० आई० "एम०" के गुंडे हैं। मैं शरीफ़ आदमी इनके बीच में खड़ा हूं। ये लड़ें या वे लड़ें लेकिन मार मेरी हो रही है। इन्होंने बताया कि कुछ डिमांस्ट्रेशन के हल्ले में महिलाएं मारी गयी हैं। इसकी जितनी भी निन्दा की जाए कम है। लेकिन क्या सी० पी० आई० "एम०" की सरकार इस बात से मुंह मोड़ सकती है कि कलकत्ता कारपोरेशन के चुनावों के अंदर इन्होंने क्या-क्या नहीं किया। बम फोड़े हैं, लाठियां चलायी हैं, गुंडागर्दी की है। मेरे पास मेरी पार्टी

[जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर]

ने 20 पेज की रिपोर्ट भेजी है अगर प्रस्तुत कर दूं तो त्रिपुरा के मामले पर भी बहस कर ली जाये।

कई माननीय सदस्य: हो जाए।

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर: बाहर से गुंडे भर्ती किये गये। मेरी पार्टी के लोग वर्दमान और अन्य जिलों के अंदर कोई डिमांस्ट्रेशन नहीं कर रहे थे। वहां पर कोई बस नहीं जलायी गयी थी ...**(व्यवधान)** यही बात कह रहा हूं ...**(व्यवधान)** यही तो जुल्म है। ये कहते हैं कि नान एक्जिस्टेंट है। इनकी बात मैंने मान ली ...**(व्यवधान)** लेकिन नान-एक्जिस्टेंट का मतलब क्या यह है कि हमारे लोगों का मर्डर करें, कत्ल करें। अगर ताकतवर के साथ लड़ रहे हैं तो समझ में आ सकता है। लेकिन आप कहते हैं कि आपको ताकत नहीं है। यदि मान लिया जाये कि ताकत नहीं है तब यह तो और भी अधिक जुल्म है कि ताकत नहीं है लेकिन मेरी पार्टी के दफ्तर जलाये जा रहे हैं। मेरी पार्टी के वर्कर्स को मारा जा रहा है। ...**(व्यवधान)** अगर आप चाहते हैं तो मैं पूरी रिपोर्ट पेश कर दूंगा। लेकिन जुल्म क्यों हो रहा है? जुल्म इसलिए हो रहा है कि सी० पी० आई० "एम०" लेफ्ट फ्रंट की सरकार वहां पर अपनी एतमाद अर्थात् विश्वास खो चुकी है **(व्यवधान)** लोकतंत्रवाद वहां पर खत्म हो चुका है **(व्यवधान)**

श्री दीपेन घोष: इसलिए उनको कलकत्ता में दोनों सीटें मिली हैं ...**(व्यवधान)**

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर: लेकिन आपकी सरकार की ताकत भी कम हुई है। मेरी इल्तिजा यह है कि वे दोनों लड़ें लेकिन गुंडागर्दी न करें, हम शरीफों के मामले में दखलअंदाजी न करें। अगर मेरे मित्र दीपेन घोष जी चाहते हैं कि त्रिपुरा की घटना पर बहस हो तो मुझे मंजूर है कि जरूर होनी चाहिए लेकिन साथ ही कलकत्ता के कारपोरेशन चुनाव की रिपोर्ट पर भी बहस हो जाए।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri Gurudas Das Gupta. He is the last speaker. I am not allowing anybody else. Afterwards, I will ask the Prime Minister to reply. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal): Madam, in West Bengal, we have a peculiar combination of political forces which seek to take political advantage and run down the properly elected Left Front Government of West Bengal. That is the politics of convenience and this politics is being properly manipulated on the one side by Congress and on the other side by a brand of communalists led by BJP *(Interruptions)* Madam, it is BJP which is trying to engineer communal riots in those districts where the minority population lives in quite large numbers, particularly in the border areas. Therefore, we are facing a serious problem of communal strife and disturbance. This situation is sought to be exploited by the BJP-Congress combination in West Bengal. This is my first point. Secondly,.....

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MATHUR: They were allies of the Congress earlier.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: What has happened in West Bengal? It is true that some deplorable incidents have taken place in Birati and Bantola. Nobody holds any brief for any person who outrages the modesty of women, whether it is in West Bengal, whether it is in Kerala, whether it is in Tripura or anywhere else in the country. I should tell you that this is a law and order problem. I do not belong to CPM. I have my differences with CPM. But I may tell you frankly that the CPM cannot be blamed for the disturbances that took place in Birati and Bantola. And it is our Chief Minister who did not take a longer time to announce a judicial enquiry into all that happened in Bantola. The Birati incident is also deplorable. But this is a law and order problem. Mrs. Natarajan should have looked at the problem from that angle instead of giving it a political colour. *(Interruptions)* Madam, I should be allowed. Madam, what is happening in Calcutta? Hundred buses have been burnt. That is number one. *(Interruptions)* Secondly, Madam, I promise to produce before the House the documents from the columns of the daily newspaper to show that Behala Thana was occupied by the demonstrators, and the demonstration was headed by an ex-Member of Lok Sabha who is a Congress

member. Her photograph has appeared in the Calcutta Press. *(Interruptions)* Thirdly, the Deputy Commissioner of Calcutta Police has been coloured blind with ink by the demonstrators of the Congress. Therefore, the situation there is that the Congress is building up a movement to paralyse the Government which they will not be able to do. As far as the cadres' rallying is concerned, the Congress has a clear political role by rallying its cadres in the streets. We can also rally our cadres to build up a political campaign. *(Interruptions)* We shall also rally our cadres in the streets of Calcutta to build up a public opinion. That democratic right you cannot take away from us. *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have allowed him. Don't disturb him.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: I put a question. The Indian Constitution gives us the right to building up a movement protesting the Government policy. The Congress is at liberty to build up a political movement against fare rise, against the policy of the West Bengal Government. But that movement should be within the parameter of the democratic right that the Constitution has given. If a peaceful agitations turns into a violent agitation and results in burning down of trams and buses and also capturing of police stations, then that is not a political movement. That is a disruptive, violent movement. I caution the Congress. If you allow this violent movement, then the same tactics can be adopted by other people where you are in power. Therefore...*(Interruptions)*...I want the House to kindly remember that if this method is taken to, it will boomerang...*(Interruptions)*...And what the Congress is doing in West Bengal is a murder of democracy, and the game of the Congress is being abetted by the BJP, the communal force of the country.

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now the reply by the Prime Minister...

श्री सुरेश पचौरी : (मध्य प्रदेश) महोदया, आल-इंडिया मेडिकल इंस्टीट्यूट की सारी व्यवस्था ठप्प हो गई है। वहां पेशेंट्स के नये रजिस्ट्रेशन नहीं हो पा रहे हैं। एक्स-रे फेसिल्टी, ई॰ सी॰ जी॰ की फेसिल्टी सारी ठप्प पड़ी हुई है। बाथ-रूम्स में वाटर सप्लाई बंद हो गई है। टायलेट्स गंदे पड़े हुए हैं। वहां जो भी नये पेशेंट्स जा रहे हैं, उनको इन पांच हजार क्लास 4 की स्ट्राईक की वजह से स्वास्थ्य सुविधायें नहीं मिल पा रही हैं। लोगों का जन-जीवन जो है, वह बहुत दूभर हो गया है।

यह बहुत महत्वपूर्ण मसला है। वहां के लोगों ने 24 जुलाई को अथारिटीज़ को नोटिस दे दिया था। लेकिन इस सरकार ने पहले से कोई कारगर कदम नहीं उठाए। वहां के मेडिकल सुपरिंटेंडेंट ने यह कहा है कि उनके पास जितने रिसोर्सेज़ हैं ...**(व्यवधान)** उनसे एम्पलाइज़ की मांगें मंजूर कर सकते हैं। इसलिए उन्हें निर्देशित किया जाए कि वह अपने रिसोर्सेज़ से मांगों को स्वीकारें। ...**(व्यवधान)** लेकिन यह सरकार कुछ नहीं कर रही है।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Pachouri, there is a Special Mention on it which is being permitted by the Chairman. At that time, you can raise it. *(Interruptions)*

DR. G. VIJAYA MOHAN REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): Madam, I want to make a submission. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Madam, I want to bring to your notice...*(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. We have the reply of the Prime Minister. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: I will be very short. *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I cannot allow it. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Madam, a very senior bureaucrat... *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Dr. Vijaya Mohan Reddy wants to say something. Let me first hear him.

DR. G. VIJAYA MOHAN REDDY: Madam, I had been a member of a four-member delegation which went to Tripura recently...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Tripura has been talked about. *(Interruptions)*

DR. G. VIJAYA MOHAN REDDY: We heard the sad account given by the men and women there. We saw the plight of women who had lost their husbands and sons. We saw the plight of women who had been raped. They came and told us. We had to bow our heads in shame. We had to shed our tears. *(Interruptions)* Let my friends from the Congress listen to this. This is something which has happened. This is something which is happening. *(Interruptions)* Tribal women. Their husbands are being beaten. *(Interruptions)* Women are raped. They cannot stay in their houses. Crimes are taking place repeatedly. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: What about Mr. N. T. Rama Rao? What happened to his daughter? *(Interruptions)*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (Bihar): Madam, this should be expunged. There is a limit to this. This cannot be allowed. *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ahluwalia, we are discussing the atrocities on women. I will implore upon you not to mention anybody's daughter. This House is not to discuss personalities. No. We are not going to discuss. I will not allow you. I will not permit you. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: He is reflecting their culture. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY (Tamil Nadu): Madam, you must expunge it from the record. *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't get agitated. Please sit down. *(Interruptions)*

Mr. Gopalsamy, please take your seat. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: If a Member of Parliament belonging to the Congress (I) can behave in this fashion in the House, you can imagine the behaviour of his partymen in the streets of Calcutta. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: It is a total shame to Mr. Shiv Shanker, Mr. Chavan and Mr. Salve. *(Interruptions)*

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त (मध्य प्रदेश): मैं यह कहना चाह रहा हूं, मैं यह अर्ज करना चाह रहा हूं ...**(व्यवधान)**

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Sikander Bakht wants to say something. He is a senior Member. Let us hear him. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM (Andhra Pradesh): Madam, unless he apologises... *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. Let us hear Mr. Sikander Bakht.

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: डिप्टी चेयरमैन साहिबा, मैं सिर्फ यह अर्ज करना चाह रहा हूं कि इससे पहले इस सदन का कोई दूसरा कारोबार लिया जाए यह तय होना चाहिए कि किस किस्म की भाषा का इस हाउस में इस्तेमाल होना है और कब तक होना है। यह तो इंतहा से ज्यादा शर्मनाक हो चुका है। यहां तो बैठना दुशवार हो गया है। किस किस्म के अलफाज़ आगे सुनने के लिए हमको तैयार रहना चाहिए? इससे पहले कि कोई दूसरा कारोबार चले यह तय होना चाहिए कि किस किस्म की तहज़ीब का मुज़ाहिरा हम करना चाहते हैं, किस किस्म के अलफाज़ का इस्तेमाल हम करना चाहते हैं? यह तो हद हो गई है, यहां बैठ कर दम घुटने लगा है।

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, he must apologise. *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is the Leader of the House. Let him have a say.

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY): Madam Deputy Chairman, again and again and every day such expressions are being used on the floor of the House. Vulger, ugly, shameful expressions are uttered without restraint. *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Leader of the House is on his legs. I will

allow him. I will not permit anybody. *(Interruptions)* Please take your seat.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Madam, the House atmosphere has been fouled by such expressions, by such behaviour. We are all concenred. And Mr. Ahluwalia in particular, why he is deliberately creating this situation, spoiling the atmosphere in the House, I do not understand. So, if you have to function as an hon. Member of the House, if you have got a sense of respect, I plead with you as a brother M.P., apologise to the House and hereafter promise that such things will not be repeated by you in this House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Or by anybody else.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Yes, by anybody else. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA (Karnataka): We have learnt these expressions from them. We have not forgotten the days when vulgar language was being used. *(Interruptions)* Just because they have become Ministers of some of them are sitting on that side, they cannot give sermons. We cannot forget what has happened in this House. *(Interruptions)* They cannot go on giving sermons like this.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All right. I leave it to the House to decide what kind of language we are going to use. It is up to you. It is not my problem. If you want to use a language...*(Interruptions)* which reflects the dignity of this House, you are welcome. If you want to use the language which reflects your own feelings, it is up to you. I have no objection. I am just here to monitor everybody's speech, not beyound that. I am not anybody's conscience-keeper.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE (Maharashtra): Madam, sermonising and...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Mr. Salve, just permit me to speak for two minutes.

Madam, I do not think any Member from the other side will agree to such expressions made on the floor of the House. Of course, we belong to different political parties, but...

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: All of a Sudden you have become a saint now. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: If there is a remark made against a family member...*(Interruptions)*. Please listen. Let me complete. I have not said anything against you. Let me have my say. *(Interruptions)*. Mr. Ramachandran, let me complete. *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Gopalsamy, I request you...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: If there is a remark against any member or his family belonging to the Congress Party, I would be the first person to attack and oppose such a remark. We are here as members of a family of politicians, to whichever party we may belong. Therefore, Mr. Ahluwalia, I beg of you to kindly apologise...*(Interruptions)* Never before has it happened on the floor of this House. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA (Rajasthan): Madam, on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is on a point of order. Let me hear him.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Madam, I have got a very simple point of order and a very simple submission to make. On this particular comment which the hon. Member from the other side made, there is absolutely no ground for a debate to start.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Exactly.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: It is unparliamentary; it has to be expunged. You, please, give your ruling and expunge the remark and the matter will come to an end.

Madam, whether a particular Member from their party behaves in a particular

[Shri Kamal Morarka]

manner is not for our party to decide. It is entirely for their leaders to decide. In the morning, we were given homilies and I was listening in absolute peace and quietness when Mr. Salve was telling us that we were irrelevant and that we should learn how to listen. I am sure he did not mean that we have to listen to what Mr. Ahluwalia said just now. I am prepared to go by what Mr. Shiv Shanker or Mr. Salve said. But please expunge this remark and end this controversy. Please expunge this remark.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Madam, it is unexceptionable that if anything has been uttered by the hon. Member which is beneath the dignity of the House, it must be expunged. But we are not impressed by the homilies, sermons and the discourses being given by them. It does not behave them to be quoting scriptures...We are still willing. But so far as we are concerned, it is absolutely necessary that we should maintain the dignity of the House. But before you condemn a person, kindly look at the records and hear the Member what he has to say and if you find thereafter that there is something undignified, I leave the entire dicision to you. We will abide by it. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, you persue the records...*(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I request the hon. Members, we cannot allow a debate on it...Just a minute, please...If the Member is getting up, perhaps he is apologising or perhaps he is explaining. I do not know..... I do not know what he is going to.....

SHRI K. G. MAHESWARAPPA (Karnataka): He will create further problems....Dont's allow him to speak....It is a disgrace...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: I can assure you that we will stand for the dignity of the House, we will stand for good demeanour. But I am unable to understand why they are unwilling to let the records be seen and let him explain what he has to say. And if after that you find that there has been anything undignified, we will abide by anything that you order us to do...*(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute. I would say. Mr. Salve, I agree with you. There are a few things which are uttered in the House which may not be unparliamentary. But I request humbly all the Members on my left, right and front that we should confine ourselves to the matter in the House. We should not bring in people who do not belong to this House. It is one of the prerequisites of our debates. We should not talk derogatory things about people who cannot defend themselves. And while you are talking of Tripura, I would not mind if a Member talks about Tripura or any other place where women have been raped or anything. I have allowed Mrs. Jayanthi Natarajan. But what somebody's daughter has got to do with it? It is very very....it is not fair to that person and the daughter or anybody's daughter, yours or mine. We all have daughters and sons and relations. Let us discuss the things in a dignified manner. That is the only request I have to make. If some people made mistakes, two mistakes will never make it right. So, if you feel that this side of the people were making mistakes and if you think it was a mistake and if you also want to commit it, please don't do it. I only request you, don't commit the mistake if you think it was a mistake. That is all.

1.00 P.M.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Madam, if you allow Mr. Ahluwalia to speak, it is an atrocity on the House....*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Madam, the honour and respect of any one from public life or otherwise or of his daughter, wife or children, are as sacrosanct as that of any one of us. The question is only this: When you are trying to condemn somebody, please give him a fair opportunity to explain what he has

said—and I am willing to abide by your order in the matter. Madam, both parties will abide by what you decide.

SHRI K. G. MAHESWARAPPA: No further explanation...*(Interruptions)*. .

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Madam, we are willing to abide by whatever your verdict is.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Salve, what Mr. Ahluwaiia...*(Interruptions)*...I will allow him, I will listen to him. I am only asking, was Mr. Ahluwalia's remark—I didn't hear it fully but what everybody has heard—in relation to Tripura? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: It is a matter of natural justice, Madam. When you are passing sermons against me...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not passing any sermons.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: No, no, the Leader of the House. I must explain my position...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI K. G. MAHESWARAPPA: He is casting aspersions on the Chair.

...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: You passed sermons against me. You do not know what I said. I want to explain my position. With your permission. Madam.....*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Whatever decision you may impose on us, we are willing to abide by that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: The Leader of the House was passing sermons against the Opposition Members and justifying...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute, please. Please take your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: They are not allowing me. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: No personal explanation. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I said, please take your seats. Anything which is spoken in this House has to be relevant and, I think, what Mr. Ahluwalia said is not relevant to what he was talking, about Tripura. So, it is irrelevant and we are not going to take it into consideration. It is over now.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: Madam... ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: He must apologize. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: Either he should apologize or the Chair should ask him to withdraw from the House.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: It should not be expunged; he should be asked to withdraw it. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SYED SIBTEY RAZI (Uttar Pradesh): Has anything come on record?

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: If they have the decency, let him apologize. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): Madam, it is not a question of the prestige of Mr. Ahluwalia as a Member of the House. It is a question of honour of this House. We are all Members of this House. If Mr. Ahluwalia has any sense of honour—when we, individually and collectively have a sense of honour, and it is a disgrace to the House—he must have apologized amply or withdrawn from the House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I do not know how it is relevant to this. I do not understand what it has to do with Tripura and what it has to do with Andhra.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: It is intervention irrelevantly, scandalously, scurrilously. The man must be named and asked to withdraw. *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ahluwalia, why don't you go and say that you withdraw the remarks? It is over, finished. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI M. M. JACOB (Kerala): Sit down. Why are you interfering?

The Leader of Opposition (SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER): Madam Deputy Chairman, I rise with a little bit of agony that in this House for quite a long time often certain expressions, and misbehaviours have been exhibited by various Members, which is rather unfortunate.

SHRI MENTY PADMANABHAM: Why are you trying to generalise? *(Interruptions)*

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: It has been happening. There I will not yield. Many of you are also responsible. Please, let us not forget about this. Let us remind ourselves. If we are going to bring this House into this pass, we will not be forgiven by posterity. All of us have been misbehaving. We have not even been respecting the institution of the Prime Minister. Must we be guilty of that type of thing? *(Interruptions)* When I am saying this, I am saying this with great agony. Please listen to me.

Madam, if anything has been said against the dignity of any gentleman who is outside, it is reprehensible. If anything is said against the dignity of a Member of this House, that is also reprehensible. I have not heard what exactly he has said. That is why I was trying to go to the Secretary-General and find out what exactly he said. He told me, and I am repeating it.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: No. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Just listen to me. I am not protecting any person, I will not protect. If somebody has said something wrong, I will not protect him. I assure you this much. I will be with you if somebody has said something wrong. I was also trying to find out from the Secretary-General what exactly has been said. I would like to assure that if something wrong has been said by him, he should take punishment. I am not going to protect him. No Member here will protect him. But what he was trying to say was this which I would repeat. If something is found to be wrong on record, it is not a mere question of expunction. I will not be satisfied by expunction. He must stand up and apologise. But the point is what he has said. He was only trying to tell me, the wording that has gone here, is this. I do not know. He says, "I have not completed my sentence. 'What happened to NTR's daughter', that is all." He has gone right up to that. *(Interruptions)* Just listen. Listen to me for a while. This intention creates a lot of problems. We also become intemperate. But that is not the proper approach. I would rather like to say that if he was trying to cast an aspersion on this child—she is as much a daughter to me as she is a daughter to anyone else—it is condemnable. *(Interruptions)*

Let me say what he wanted to say. If it is condemnable, every one of us would join you to condemn him. *(Interruptions)* No, no, you stopped him. *(Interruptions)* He says...*(Interruptions)* What he was trying to tell was that his daughter had to go to the court for protection against the son-in-law. This is what he told me that he wanted to say this. *(Interruptions)* If there is any reasonable basis that he was casting aspersions...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: May I just draw your attention? *(Interruptions)* Just a minute. I would like my friend Shiv Shanker Ji not to forget the context, the context in which he made the derogatory reference. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Gurupadaswamy Ji, I would like to say one thing. Please yield for a minute.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: I am requesting you.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: I would assure you that if it is the decision of the House that even without his completion of the sentence it is an aspersion on the

child, it is condemnable. Nobody is going to protect him. (*Interruptions*) Why can't you people listen? (*Interruptions*) Please listen. (*Interruptions*) Why can't you people listen? And you want to punish like that.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: May I remind you, Shiv Shanker Ji, you were discussing about the atrocities on women. That was the context. In that context he made the reference, a very derogatory remark. Please don't miss the context. We object to that.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: I would like to say just this much. The point is, if he was making a reference, he was saying you people are speaking about Tripura. Now, has he cast an aspersion by this? If by this itself it is casting an aspersions, then it is condemnable. But it is not. (*Interruptions*) You must give him a chance to explain...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: It is the intention that matters. It is more the intention of the person who has used the expression in this context. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: What aspersions has he made? (*Interruptions*) Then let him say. If he has said something wrong, he should apologise. I have already said that.

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: शिव शंकर साहब खुद भी आम तौर पर निहायत मौहज़्ज जबान इस्तेमाल करते हैं। यह अल्फाज से खेलने की बात नहीं है और न अल्फाज से हमारे मोहतरम दोस्त ने कहा कि इनको एक्सपंज करा दिया जाये किस्सा खत्म हो, बिल्कुल खत्म नहीं। मामला यह है कि खाली एट्रोसिटिज ऑन वूमेन की बात नहीं हो रही है, कलकत्ते में रेप्स हो रहे हैं, त्रिपुरा में रेप्स हो रहे हैं और उस वक्त एक गैर मौजूद साहबजादी का नाम लिया जाता है और उसके लिये हम अल्फाज का तानाबाना बुनने की कोशिश करें।

देखिये, मेरी गुजारिश सुनिए। मैं दो बातें अर्ज करूंगा ...(**व्यवधान**)

†Transliteration in Arabic Script.

شری سکندر بخت: شیو شنکر صاحب خود بھی عام طور پر نہایت مہذب زبان استعمال کرتے ہیں یہ الفاظ سے کھیلنے کی بات نہیں ہے اور نہ الفاظ سے ہمارے محترم دوست نے کہا کہ انکو ایکسپنج کر دیا جائے - قصہ ختم ہو - بالکل ختم نہیں - معاملہ یہ ہے کہ خالی ایٹروسٹیز آن وومین کی بات نہیں ہو رہی ہے - کلکتہ میں ریپس ہو رہے ہیں - تریپورہ میں ریپس ہو رہے ہیں اور اس وقت ایک غیر موجود صاحبزادی کا نام لیا جاتا ہے اور اسکے لئے ہم الفاظ کا تانا بانا بننے کی کوشش کریں -

شری سکندر بخت: دیکھئے میری گذارش سنیئے - میں دو باتیں عرض کرونگا - مداخلت

श्रीमती सत्या बहिन (उत्तर प्रदेश): जो हाऊस में नाम आ रहा है ...(**व्यवधान**)

श्री पी० शिव शंकर: यह पार्टी का मामला नहीं है It is a question of human dignity.

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: मैं यह कह रहा हूं कि अल्फाज से न खेलिए बल्कि तमाम जिस माहौल में यह बात कही गई है किसी गैर मौजूदा आदमी की बेटी का नाम लिया गया है—कांटेक्स्ट को जाने दीजिए—यह आबोहवा खत्म

[श्री सिकन्दर बख्त]

होनी चाहिए। इसमें कोई नई बात नहीं है, यह तो रोज ही हो रहा है। जिक्र एक इंस्टांस का नहीं है बल्कि तमाम आबोहवा, तमाम वातावरण राज्य सभा का बिगाड़ दिया गया है। **(व्यवधान)** चंद लोग हैं जो बिगाड़ते हैं। मुझे माफ करेंगे शिव शंकर साहब ने कहा कि हम सब बिगाड़ते हैं। मैं कम से कम बाहर रहना चाहता हूं इस ब्रेकट से। मैं कम से कम तहजीब के दायरों में अपनी बात कहना मुनासिब समझता हूं। अल्फाज से खेलने की कोशिश नहीं करनी चाहिए। निहायत नामुनासिब कांटेक्स्ट के वक्त इस बच्ची का नाम लिया गया है वह नहीं लिया जाना चाहिए। **(व्यवधान)**

شری سکندر بخت: میں یہ کہہ رہا ہوں - یہ الفاظ سے نہ کھیلئے بلکہ تمام جس ماحول میں یہ بات کہی گئی ہے کسی غیر موجود آدمی کی بیٹی کا نام لیا گیا ہے - کانٹیکسٹ کو جانے دیجئے - یہ آب و ہوا ختم ہونی چاہئے - اسمیں کوئی نئی بات نہیں ہے - یہ روز ہی ہو رہا ہے - ذکر ایک انسٹانس کا نہیں ہے بلکہ تمام آب و ہوا - تمام واتاورن راجہ سبھا کا بگاڑ دیا گیا ہے - " (مداخلت) " چند لوگ ہیں جو بگاڑتے ہیں - مجھے معاف کرینگے - شیو شنکر صاحب نے کہا کہ ہم سب بگاڑتے ہیں - میں کم سے کم باہر رہنا چاہتا ہوں اس بریکیٹ سے میں کہہ سکتا ہوں کہ تہذیب کے دائروں میں اپنی بات

مناسب سمجھتا ہوں - الفاظ سے کھیلنے کی کوشش نہیں کرنی چاہئے - نہایت نامناسب کانٹیکسٹ کے وقت اس بچی کا نام لیا گیا ہے وہ نہیں لیا جانا چاہئے - "مداخلت"

श्री एन० के० पी० साल्वे: सिकन्दर बख्त साहब वजा फरमा रहे हैं। शिव शंकर साहब ने जो बात कही वह आपके ताल्लुक से नहीं थी। इसका सन्दर्भ कोई और है। हम सभ्रांत और सुसंस्कृत व्यवहार के बारे में किसी और से सबक नहीं लेना चाहते। **(व्यवधान)** मैं आप से कह रहा हूं कि कुछ लोग हैं। महज किसी बच्ची के मुतल्लिक गलत नीयत से एक शब्द भी कहा गया हो तो हम सजायाफ्ता हैं, हम को सजा दे दीजियेगा। उस शब्द को सिर्फ सदन की कार्रवाई से निकालने से काम नहीं चलेगा। उस सदस्य को पूरी सजा लेनी पड़ेगी। मगर सवाल यह है कि वह क्या कहना चाहते हैं? उसकी नीयत क्या है यह समझने के लिए ...**(व्यवधान)**

श्री मोहम्मद खलीलुर रहमान (आन्ध्र प्रदेश): नीयत तो आ गयी है ...**(व्यवधान)**

श्री यशवंत सिन्हा: यह नहीं चल सकता। **(व्यवधान)**

श्री एन० के० पी० साल्वे: किसी बच्ची के ऊपर, किसी साहबजादी के ऊपर अगर कोई इल्जाम नहीं लगना चाहिए तो हमारे सदस्य के ऊपर भी इल्जाम अगर लगे तो वह सही बात के ऊपर नहीं लगना चाहिए। इस तरह की राजनीति का मसला मत दोहराइये। यह सदन की गरिमा का सवाल है। यह सदन की प्रतिष्ठा का सवाल है। इसको आप लोग राजनीति का मसला मत बनाइये। **(व्यवधान)** यह राजनीति अपनायेंगे तो बात दूसरी हो जायेगी। **(व्यवधान)** हम जब यह बात मानने को तैयार हैं कि हमारी गलती है तो एक दफा नहीं दस दफा हम माफी मांगेंगे। हमारी गलती है या नहीं यह आप तय कर दीजिए और यह तय करने के पहले ...**(व्यवधान)**

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: We shall not. We want an apology. If he

does not, we want to move a resolution to this effect. We will not stop. This must be brought to an end once for all. This is a question of the whole House. We will not permit this.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Madam Deputy Chairman, may I make one request to you? Let the full text be there. Let us go through it. I am prepared to sit down with the Leader of the House on any reasonable construction. If something is wrong, then, he must be punished. I am prepared for that.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: This is not allowed. I have a right to express my point of view I need not agree with Mr. Shiv Shanker...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: There is a lot of confusion. I would not like to defend that man but we want the text of the speech.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: They want to politicise the issue.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: I would not agree for a condemnation without going through the record. We want to see the record.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: I have a right to express my point of view.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Abrar Ahmed, please take your seat...*(Interruptions)*...Please take your seats. I am on my legs. In any case, Mr. Ahluwalia spoke without my permission. That is the reason why I ask you people not to interject because that would create unpleasantness in the House. In any case it would not go on record. But what the gentleman was speaking about Tripura has a certain context. If Mr. Ahluwalia did not mean it—I feel he is a dignified Member—he should get up and say he did not mean it and finish it up. Why do you want to discuss it later? We don't want to discuss other peoples personal matters You say "sorry" and finish it up.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: He should apologise.

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया: महोदया, तहजीब की बात इस सदन में की गई है...**(व्यवधान)**।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Are you willing to withdraw your words or you are not willing to withdraw?

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया: मुझे अपने शब्द वापस लेने का मौका तो दीजिए, क्या वह मौका भी नहीं देंगे?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Do you want to withdraw your words or you do not want to withdraw your words?

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया: एक शब्द में तो सारी बात वापस नहीं होती है। आपके रिपोर्टर ने दो शब्द लिखे हैं और उसके खिलाफ मेरे ऊपर इतने शब्द लिख डाले गये हैं, पूरे पृष्ठ लिख डाले गये हैं। पूरा हिन्दुस्तान कल को जानेगा कि अहलुवालिया ने इस सदन में अशोभनीय बर्ताव किया है। पूरा हिन्दुस्तान इस बात को जानेगा। लेकिन सच्चाई क्या है, यह मैं आपके ऊपर छोड़ देता हूं। मैंने कोई भी असंसदीय या कोई भी अनपार्लियामेंटरी, अशोभनीय शब्द किसी के मन को चोट पहुंचाने के लिए नहीं कहे हैं। अगर किसी को चोट पहुंची है तो मैं उसकी क्षमा याचना करता हूं, किन्तु उसका गलत इस्तेमाल न किया जाये, धन्यवाद।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now that is over. *(Interruptions)*. Now, the Prime Minister.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Madam, the Civil Aviation Secretary has gone on leave. *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No. You might ask many things. Please take your seat. I am not permitting anything.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Six months have gone and the Civil Aviation Ministry has sent the papers. *(Interruptions)*. It is a very serious matter. *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You can raise it later on. You can raise it after his speech.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: This is a matter between the Prime Minister's office and the Civil Aviation Ministry.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You can raise it afterwards.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: The Civil Aviation Secretary has gone on leave and the country is incurring nearly Rs. 200/- crores loss and the Airbus has been grounded for six months. We want to know—the Prime Minister is also here—when the aircraft is going to fly again. Taxpayers' money is going down the drain and in the bureaucracy Mr. Ganesan has gone leave. We want to know from the Prime Minister...*(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat. *(Interruptions)*.

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE (PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE): Officers' conduct cannot be discussed in the House according to rules. *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The House stands adjourned for lunch for one hour.

The House then adjourned for lunch at twenty-three minutes past one of the clock.

The House reassembled after lunch at twenty-five minutes past two of the clock.

The Deputy Chairman in the Chair.

CLARIFICATIONS ON STATEMENT REGARDING IMPLEMENTATION OF MANDAL COMMISSION'S REPORT —contd.

THE PRIME MINISTER (SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH): Madam Deputy Chairman, first I would like to thank the hon. Members and the leaders of all the parties for their general support to the steps we have taken for implementation of the Mandal Commission Report. Apart from their general support, they have also mentioned certain steps that we should take and they have given suggestions. I am thankful to them. In fact, this is the realisation of the dream of Bharat Ratna Dr. B. R. Ambedkar, of the great Periyar Ramaswamy and Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia. It has been the aspiration of a very large section of people who in the present system are condemned to social inequity since their very birth to the last breath. Whatever they may do, whatever maybe their performance, their merit, they are unable to shake off these disadvantages throughout their lives. In fact, I would very much agree with Ram Awdeshji that if you really look at the issue minutely, it is not so much the issue of economic condition but of the power structure—the power structure which has crystallised in a social structure. So, the essence of the issue is, how the power sharing is distributed socially. And to confine it only to the categories of social and economic, will not be full understanding of the problem. It should be understood that social structure is not only expressive of certain social relations or of economic relations, it is expressive of a power structure which is perhaps much more powerful than the super-imposition of other structures, much more powerful than the express political power that we invoke. Bureaucracy is a very important component of this whole power structure. It is not merely a question of giving job and employment only or just alleviating the economic conditions of our people. In the whole machinery of decision-making, of sharing of power or shaping of the destiny of the country, whether all these sections which have been deprived by the present social order, are they going to get any share in this country or not? This is the issue is this: So, it is not a mere question of grants from the treasury but our share in governance, and in the bureaucracy is an important part of governance. So I am very clear, the National Front is very clear, that when it comes forward with these proposals of reservation for socially backward classes